

The Evaluation Impact Program of Open Selection on High Leadership Position Career Employee in Banten Provincial Government

Dian Wirtadipura¹, R.Madhakomala² and Yetty Supriyati²

¹Doctoral Candidate Science Management Program at Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Jakarta-Indonesia

²Professor at Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Jakarta-Indonesia

Keywords: Program Impact Evaluation, Open Selection, Employee Career

Abstract: The dynamics of business in the current digital economy era are very fast changing, requiring the Central Government and Regional Government to prepare for the development of reliable human resources, to provide excellent service. Open selection program are becoming popular nowadays to recruit competent and professional employees, although on the other hand it requires employees to plan and achieve their career independently, because leader and human resource human organization are completely free of hand. The purpose of this study is to develop a theoretical model to approach the goal free evaluation of Michael Scriven. Data was collected through interview, observation and analysis of document on 120 people who worked on open selection program. This study found that leader support, the role of human resources management organization and individual employees in the open selection path. In addition, it also provide some suggestion to human resources management organization in order to improve their performance.

1 INTRODUCTION

The establishment of PermenPAN and RB law number 13 of 2014 about the procedure of openly leader's replacement in the government institution environment, the Law number 15 about State Civil Apparatus, and the Government Regulation (PP) number 11 of 2017 about the State Civil Apparatus Management. The opaque selection of the state apparatus was expected to able to choose the competent and professional state apparatus, and must be able to provide quick respond, in order to support and consolidate the digital economy business in industry evolution 4,0 era. The implementation of open selection makes the system become widely opened for every body whereas the role of Position Consideration Council (Baperjakat) was replaced by Selection Committee (Pansel); Position replacement across ministries; Local Governance and Council; the position is acquired by professional, capable, and competent people.

Several problems rise such as the lack of Good Will from local government leader, the financial problem that is more expensive in holding the open selection program than Baperjakat program.

Because, the open selection must invite the academics, the professionals from other institutions compiled by committee, the apprehensive behaviour of echelon III, they are afraid of their internal situation as there will be no promotion for the internal institution because of this open selection program, the worried feeling of the internal staff because of the new recruits, another problem from internal staff is that they feel under pressure in implementing their working performance as they must follow and obligate the significant selection assessment in order to enter the selection process. Moreover, the Position Consideration Council as the representation of Human Resource Working Performance Management possesses fewer authorities because of presence of The Selection Committee.

Before, the Baperjakat manage all level of promotions of civil state apparatus, starting from eselon IV, eselon IV to eselon III, eselon III to eselon II and eselon II to eselon I. But now, the authority to give promotion of Leader status, both Primary (eselon II) or secondary (eselon I), is acquired by Pansel (Selection Committee). The problem must be faced by the Human Resource

Working Performance Management Organisation in order to find the role model for good eselon III career staff that will receive promotion in open selection.

Next, from the previous study conducted in 2014 which is promotion time of eselon I, it selects best three candidates from 11 candidates. The result of governor choosing was already predicted by commoners that the chosen people will be those who has same perspective within the governor itself. In 2015, the 4 positions are competed over 58 candidates of the eselon II, there is disoriented event that creates apprehension among people of eselon III, they were disappointed as none of their member were chosen during the selection. Thus, it creates trust issue over Human Resource Working Performance Management organisation.

In 2016, the two positions for eselon II level, the winners were professionals that come from internal institution, the trust grow among public as they are starting to place hope in open selection program. In 2017, the selection result in 3 best people from 38 candidates who are professionals and come from internal institutions, the trust were growing among public as they trust the open selection program commenced by Human Resource Working Performance Management organisation. Furthermore, In 2017, from 7 opened position for eselon II level, there are only five chosen professionals, the two places were empty as none of them are qualified enough to reach the passing grade provided by the committee. That is why, the re-selection event was held in that time. the event shows the lack of professionals among the candidates, it was strengthened by the fact that the other five position were earned from externals. From the explanations above, the research questions of the study will be, as follow: (1) the public opinion toward civil apparatus; (2) The obstacles faced by individuals after receiving the open selection announcement; (3) the bureaucracy reformation challenge that must be faced by Human Resource Working Performance Management organisation toward the new model of career counselling post open selection program.

The study aims to reveal the negative impact of the apprehensive situation among eselon III staff, as a result of open selection program, by providing the preventive action and solutions, and to reveal the positive impact performed by the staff during the open selection program, in order to give development, and advance consolidation. This evaluation study type had another objective to describe the implementation of open selection program from High Leader Position toward Banten civil apparatus career.

2 THEORICAL FRAMEWORK

Staff always become an object for Human Resource Management, Armstrong (2009), stated that "Human resource management is a strategic, integrated and coherent approach to the employment, development and well-being of the people working in organization". Lutfim Cania (2014) stated that the organisation working performances is more important, especially in larger and more dynamic market; human resource is the key to hold the organisation in a very competitive market.

Evaluation is part of management system which are planning, organisation, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation. Without evaluation the condition of the object will remain unknown within the plans, implementation, and the result as well.

Scriven (1981) defines evaluation as a "The process of determining the merit or worth or value of something, or product of that process", based on the definition conducted by Scriven, Fitzpatrick, Sanders and Worthen (2012) support the definition of evaluation that it determines the use or advantages of an object of evaluation. more general, evaluation could be defined as process of identification, clarification, and implementation the evaluated object. it is also supported by Stufflebeam and Coryn (2014) who defines evaluation as a evaluating as the act or process of determining the merit, worth, or significance of something or the product of that process. Meanwhile, Evert Vedung (2013) defines evaluation as a careful retrospective assessment of the merit, worth and value of administration, output and outcome of government interventions, which is intended to play a role in future, practical action situations. From all expert's opinions above, it can be concluded that evaluation is a systematic assessment process through planned and coordinated actions toward the out pit of government implementation in order to find the effectiveness of a program that can be applied during and after the program.

Mohammad Zohrabi (2011), in his article entitled "An Introduction to course and/or Program Evaluation", he explained that in the early time, the evaluation of a program is quantitative and/or experimental action toward the nature. Within several times, it is found that the qualitative approach toward the nature become more effective than artificial experiment in laboratory. The most important issue during evaluations process is to reveal the on going transformation.

The definition of evaluation impact, based on Elliot Stern (2015), are : (1) Stresses the search for any effects, not only those that are intended, (2) Recognises that effects may be positive and

negative, (3) Recognises that effects of interest are “produced” (somehow caused) by the intervention, (4) Suggest the possibility of different kinds of links between all kinds of development intervention (project, programme or policy) and effects, (5) focuses on the longer-term effects of development interventions. The definition stated by Elliot concludes that evaluation impact means the impact toward the program, it could be both negative and positive impact, the impact may appear in sudden motion and gathered in long term impact.

Trish Bradbury and Darryl Forsyth (2012) explains that the procedure implementation of the selection process performed for the New Zealand athlete is a free procedure that follows whatever approach used by the coaches. It does not have much criteria that makes the athletes complained. Fortunately, after the procedure was fixed, the criteria of the selection become fair and widely opened. Thus, it makes the athletes candidates become respected. Pramila Rao (2010) stated that the practice of recruitment and selection is the main core where all aspects and function of human resource management are placed. The inappropriate worker is the result of inappropriate method, there will be no other function that will perfectly operated. Meanwhile, Luba Tomcikova (2016) stated that the practice of recruitment and selection program is one of most important aspect for the human resource management program for both new and experienced companies in business universe. Constant D. Beugre (2005) stated that the company could recruit their workers in time by using open selection through internet, the potential candidates will directly sent their curriculum vitae for the wanted position, according to Beugre stated that the career of the workers often changed because of the change in their interest, skills, the values, and working environment. Those changes are called protean career. Even though, it has positive impact, the protean career has many traps as a result of inner path of the career. Hang-Yue Ngo and Li Hui (2017) stated that both protean career orientation and working commitment are positively related to career satisfaction. The relation is mediated by working correspondence and self eviction.

The theoretical framework above could be formulated into: (1) the worker theory as the most important human resource management, (2) the impact evaluation theory in order to reveal the unanswered impact, (3) the open selection theory as part of management function, (4) the worker career as a supporting theory of the study.

3 RESEARCH METHOD

This evaluation study will implemented in order to find exact assessment toward a program and become decision maker of a program, as stated by Fitzpatrick (2012) “evaluation as the identification, clarification, and application of defensible criteria to determine an evaluation objects value (worth or merit) in relation to those criteria” it aims to overview the ongoing program or project during planning section. Not only over viewing the program, whether it is on the correct track or not, the evaluation study is also use to measure and predict the impact of a program which will be provided in this study. The approach used in this study is Goal Free Evaluation by Michael Scriven, within the impact of open selection program toward government civil apparatus of Banten as the main focus of the study. The approach does not take much concern on the objective of the study, but it takes much concern toward the impact of the program that covers negative, positive, and side positive effect of the program.

The primary data if the study uses 100 people as key informants who are eselon III staff, and twenty supporting informants, the leader of eselon III and its stakeholders will be used as a data triangulation. The primary data uses interview and observation as the data collection instrument. The interview and observation with eselon III staff in which the researchers commence systematic questions. One specific set of questions with similar words and orders will be used. Meanwhile, the secondary data as a method triangulation is taken from direct observation and documentation. The theory triangulation uses theories and related previous studies. The result of interview and observation has unique sign of descriptive code, then it is categorized based on the themes of data, the theory will be chosen based on the result of comparison between interview and documentations. An evaluation is used to answer the question and implement the criteria to determine the value or meaning of something. The evaluation's questions provides direction and formulation of the evaluation implementation, without those aspects, the evaluators will lose their focus and expectation. That is why, the evaluation criteria is needed to define the successfulness criteria of a program. Criteria are characteristic of a program that is known as important relevant basis in order to perform evaluation research. Whereas, the evaluation criteria of this study displayed on the table below:

Table 1: The Criteria Evaluation of Negative Impact

Evaluation Phase	Sub focus	The Aspects	Successful Criteria
Negative Impact	The bad impact is happening as a result of open selection process of high leader position toward Banten Province Officers	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Illegal Procedure Mechanism; 2. Behaviour Weakens; 3. Time management to hold the event; 4. Misbehaviour; 5. Cost burden. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There is no promotion for the "chosen" internal candidates; but illegal out of open selection mechanism. 2. Disoriented behaviour, lack of motivation behaviour caused by stuck career; 3. The open selection program takes longer time; 4. The new recruit officers are being ignored in the office; 5. High cost, for open selection program.

Table 2: The Criteria Evaluation of Positive Impact

Evaluation Phase	Sub focus	The Aspects	Successful Criteria
Positive Impact	The expected impact must be implemented toward open selection process of high leader position of Banten Province Officers	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Procedure mechanism; 2. Candidates participation; 3. Regeneration; 4. Track record monitoring; 5. Monitoring and Counselling for the selected officer; 6. Career pattern; 7. Provided budget. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The committee works independently; 2. People from other institution may participate; 3. Competition consolidation among internal officers; 4. The selection results in integrated officer; 5. The selected officer are given with duty orientation, gives more confidence; 6. The high leader position acquired from open selection program may hold the seat for 5 year in maximum and 2 years within on going mutation; 7. The open selection program may be implemented.

Table 3: The Criteria Evaluation of Positive Side Impact

Evaluation Phase	Sub focus	The Aspects	Successful Criteria
Positive side impact	The impact is a sudden motion that is not expected, it may support the open selection process of high leader position of Banten Province Officers	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consolidating behaviour 2. Competitive behaviour; 3. Work discipline; 4. Program's quality. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It attracts candidates with competencies; 2. Talent pool of eselon III officers through assessment; 3. The new officer obedience to follow regulation; 4. The open selection program that result in competent officers.

Table 4: Construction Process Theory

Research Question	Collecte d Data	Data Collection Techniques	Data Condensation	Result	Discussi on
How to reveal the Positive, Negative, Positive side impact of the open selection process of high leader position of Banten Province Officers could be revealed	Key informant opinion	Interview and Observation	Data Triangulation	The synchronization between the information gathered from and supporting information are matched	Tentative conclusion is discussed with report, theory, and publication
		Interview			
	Report Theory and Publication	Document Analysis	Data Triangulation	The data and theory are synchronised	

4 RESULT OF STUDY

The study is an evaluation study type in order to retrieve the unrevealed impact previously, that contributes direct impact on the career of workers. The phases of this evaluation study are, as follow:

4.1 The Analysis of Interview and Observation Data Result toward 100 Key Informants of eselon III Officers as Interview

Negative Impact

According to the difference recapitulation result on table 1, the interview and observation, it could be analysed as follow: The negative impact of

triangulation data analysis between interview towards interviewee within the field observation, considering the documentation data, there are four statements that need further analysis which are statements number 1, 4, 5, and 9, those results gain average value above 58. In order to analyse the negative impact, the researcher would use observation and documentation technique. The result of negative impact interview is = 537, the positive impact is = 845, ad the side positive impact is= 234, the total is 537+845+234=1616. The result of negative impact by observation technique is =552, the positive impact is= 847, while the positive side impact is= 240, the total is 552+847+240=1639.

The result of negative impact triangulation from 5 interview procedures and 10 statements acquired during interview, the result number 1,2,3,5 and 6 experience answer change from the total interview process which is $537/1616 \times 100\%$, it shows 33,23%. The observation technique is $552/1639 \times 100\%$, it results in 33,68%. The researcher tends to determine the result of observation as a result of negative impact evaluation, which is 33,68%. The tentative conclusion is: there is an event of bottle neck syndrome among eselon III officers; less motivation causes low working performance; open selection requires more time; open selection cost more budget.

Positive Impact

According to the difference recapitulation result on table 2, the interview and observation, it could be analysed as follow: The negative impact of triangulation data analysis between interview towards interviewee within the field observation, considering the documentation data, the result says that almost all statements of the informant's answer from number 11 to 24 are similar, but the value remains high and stable in 58-62, it means that all statements is part of open selection component.

Thus, it does not require further analysis as it is already a standard in open selection organization. The result of positive impact in interview technique is = 845, the negative impact shows = 537, and side positive impact is = 234, the total result in interview process is = 845+537+234=1616. The result of observation technique for positive impact is = 847, the negative impact shows = 552, and the side positive impact is = 240, the total of observation technique is 847+552+240=1639.

The result of positive impact triangulation from 7 interview procedures and 14 statements acquired during interview, the result shows that most of the result differs each other, it is on result number 11,12,13,14,15,16,17,18,19,20,21,22,23 and 24 from

the total interview scale $845/1616 \times 100\%$, the result is 52,29%, and observation technique acquires $847/1639 \times 100\%$ which result in 51,68%. The researcher tends to determine the result of field observation as a result of positive impact evaluation which is 51,68%. The tentative conclusions are: there are seven unique aspects which are, Good working Pansel; The quality of open selection result is excellent for high leader category; internal candidates consolidation; the open selection provides integrated new high leader; the selected leader must be confidence; legal certainty must be above the open selection; the arranged budget is provided for the open selection program.

The Positive Side Impact

According to the difference recapitulation result on table 2, the interview and observation, it could be analysed as follow: The negative impact of triangulation data analysis between interviews towards interviewee within the field observation, considering the documentation data, the result shows 3 significance statements that require further analysis. They are statement number 25, statement number 27, and statement number 30, they reach average high value above 34. The result of positive side impact in interview technique is = 234, the negative impact shows = 537, and positive impact is = 845, the total result in interview process is = $234+537+845=1616$. The result of observation technique for positive side impact is = 240, the negative impact shows = 552, and the positive impact is = 847, the total amount of observation technique is $240+552+847=1639$.

The triangulation result of positive side impact of 4 interview procedures, from 8 statements acquired, the statement number 25, 27, 28, and 32 experience in different answer from total interview scale of $234/1616 \times 100\%$, it results in 14,48%, and the observation techniques acquires $240/1639 \times 100\%$, it concludes 14,64%. The researcher tends to determine the result of field observation as a result of side positive impact evaluation. The tentative conclusions are: The officers passed from open selection program possess good skills and competencies; The eselon III officers start to leave the comfort zone into competitive zone; the discipline behaviour among officers is improving.

4.2 The Data Analysis of Interview Result toward 20 Supporting Informants Who Are eselon III Officers and Other Stakeholders

Negative Impact

Based on the result of interview process asking 20 interviewees: (1) questions about the activity of eselon III officers while inside the office in order to increase their career at post-open selection announcement program, is there any illegal attempt violating the recent mechanism? 14 people answered that there is no other option for the officers but follows the open selection mechanism; (2) questions about the officers of eselon II who ever failed in participating the open selection program, how is their working performance? Is there any weakening behaviour? 12 people answered that it is true that there is decreasing motivation in their working performance because of their stuck career; (3) question about the date and time when the open selection was held, the 13 interviewees stated that the open selection program requires more times; (4) question about the reaction of eselon III officers in receiving the new recruits from external candidates? 10 out of 20 stated that the new recruits are being ignored by the eselon officers; (5) does the open selection program cost too much budget during the process? 16 people stated that the program is one of High Cost event.

The tentative conclusion: the internal officers of eselon III are only able to proote their career through open selection; the decreasing career motivation; decreasing working performance; the duration of open selection program must be log enough; the cost to hold open selection is high.

Positive Impact

Based on the result of interview process asking 20 interviewees: (1) does the mechanism of open selection process used during the process follow the procedure? 12 people stand firm that the committee works independently; (2) do the committees perform significant participation for internal and external candidates? 11 people stated that the outer candidates may participate in the program; (3) does the regeneration process in order to increase the competition among eselon III officers goes well? 10 people said that there is a consolidation among internal officers; (4) does the process of track record of personal integrity appropriately finish? 12 people assumed that the selection process to acquire integrated officers is important; (5) does the counselling program for selected candidates give

positive impact toward the person? 13 people stated that the selected officer who receive counselling become more confident; (6) how is the pattern career of selected officer after the open selection program formulated by PAN-RB? 12 people stated that the high leader position as a result of open selection program may hold the position for 5 years, 2 years on going mutation; (7) did Banten governance already provide appropriate financial aid for the open selection program? 10 people assumed that the open selection program possessed the budget management, already.

The tentative conclusion: The committee of open selection works independently, the quality of selected officer is good, there is a consolidation among internal officers, the program results in integrated officer, the program results in confident officer, there is legal certainty above the position offered, the budget is already managed for the program.

The Positive Side Impact

Based on the result of interview process asking 20 interviewees: (1) during the recruitment, does candidates' skill and competency meet the requirement? 4 people assumed that the open selection is a favourite program for people with competencies, 16 people could not answer the question; (2) does the counsellor officer recognize about the program and use the moment to motivate working performance of eselon III officers for their skills and competencies? 5 people answered that there is an attempt from the counsellor to make talent pool of eselon III officers by competency assessment, 15 people could not answer the question; (3) does the selected leader from open selection program perform such discipline work and become role model for another officers to increase their working performance? 3 people gave their answer that the selected leader has performed their work based on the regulation, does the working performance of Banten governance increase after getting personal aid of open selection program? 20 people could not answer the question.

The tentative conclusion: the officer selected in open selection has competency, the candidates of open selection program are ready to compete, the selected officer from open selection program perform good working performance.

5 DISCUSSION

The research of evaluation of open selection program impact toward Banten government officers career. The negative impact evaluation is performed by: illegal procedure, weaken behaviour, program duration, misbehaviour and cost burden; the evaluation of positive impact is performed by: procedure mechanism, candidate's participation, regeneration, monitoring and track record, monitoring and counselling for selected officer, career pattern an budget administration; the evaluation of positive side impact is performed by: consolidating, competitive environment, discipline and program's quality.

The most significance finding of the study is bottle neck syndrome, the disorientation of working performance, the long recruitment process and high cost that become burden toward government, the selected officer possessed excellent skills and competencies, the eselon III officers start to leave their comfort zone into competitive zone, and the selected officer form open selection program perform well working performance.

In accordance with the theory of Creswell, (2009) who presents three main reasons for conducting research, first, about how research can contribute in the development of science; Second, how research can help improve or improve certain practices; Third, the results of the study will improve certain policies. Moreover, it is stated that a study can contribute to the development of science if: (1) close existing gaps, (2) replicates science, (3) expands existing knowledge, and (4) expands perspective. The researcher tried to make this study become able to contribute to science as well as the results could improve the open selection program. Therefore, open selection when associated with employee careers, as stated by Constant D. Beugre (2005) about the protean career, that although it has a positive impact, the protean career keeps many pitfalls because the path is not linear. Beugre's opinion is true, because someone who has the ability and competence will always try to participate in open selection that promises a certain career, and when there is an opportunity, anyone will try to compete in that selection, although it will not be good for their career that is not linear, this may happen when human resource management organizations have no contribution to the development of employee careers, in other words the career failure of a civil servant is one of them due to lack of the role of human resource management organizations. In fact, stated by Ngo and Hui (2017),

satisfaction of a career rise because of a positive career clarity, and there is commitment from all aspects.

In accordance with the explanation above, Dessler (2009) stated that there are three things connected each other which are officer, leader, human resource management organization whom each has unique role in developing the staff career. One of the leader's role is providing support and career assessment. Meanwhile, the role of human resource management organization is to provide the chance for officer to develop their career, the career development program, and offer some career's option toward the officers. Thus, in the officer career pattern, the role of leader and the organisation could not be untied in developing their staff's career and let them develop their own career by their self.

In order to be more specific, the bottle neck syndrome and working performance disorientation is the result of unfair leader in providing the program to whom have same perspective within their inner circle group. Moreover, the organization does not provide officers with talent pool in order to anticipate many policies related to career development; the open selection consumes much money and time which clearly take leader's attention; it takes human resource management organisation creativity; the candidates have abilities, competencies, and leave the comfort zone into competitive zone and discipline working behaviour is the role of selected officers.

6 CONCLUSIONS

The study already reveals the fact consistency that opens selection provides advantages toward the career of officers if the support from leader exist, the will from each person of the officers and the maximum role from human resource management organization.

Theoretically, the result of this study makes benefits for the management development, especially the human resource division, a new vision is revealed in this study in order to complete and cover the findings on previous studies.

For applicative purpose, the study provides information and guidance for the committee of open selection program to make effective of their budget, planning, and time management in order to satisfy all aspects within the program.

REFERENCES

- Armstrong, M. (2009), *Armstrong's Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice*, Kogan Page, London and Philadelphia.
- Beugre, CD (2005), *Human Resource Portals and the Protean Career: A Three-Factor Model*, Chapter VI, Delaware State University, USA.
- Bradbury, T & Forsyth, D (2012), 'You're in: you're out: selection practices of coaches', *Sport, Business and Management: An International Journal*, Vol 2, No 1, pp 7-20.
- Cania, L (2014), 'The Impact of Strategic Human Resources Management on Organizational Performance', *Economia Seria Management*, Vol 17, Issue 2, pp 374-379.
- Creswell, JW (2009), *RESEARCH DESIGN: Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif dan Mixed*, Penerjemah: Achmad Fawaid, Cetakan IV, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta.
- Dessler, G (2009), 'Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia', Alih Bahasa: Paramita Rahayu, Edisi kesepuluh, PT Indeks, Indonesia.
- Ngo, HY & Hui, L (2017), 'Individual Orientations and Career Satisfaction: The Mediating Roles of Work Engagement and self-Efficacy' *Journal of Career development*, XX(X), pp 1-15.
- Rao, P (2010), 'A resource-based analysis of recruitment and selection practices of Indian software companies: A case study approach', *Journal of Indian Business Research*, Vol 2, No 1, pp 32-51.
- Scriven, M. (1981), *Evaluation Thesaurus*, third edition, Gephyr Inverness, California.
- Stern, E (2015), *Impact Evaluation: A Guide for Commissioners and Managers*, Bond for International Development.
- Stufflebeam, DL & Coryn, CLS (2014), *Evaluation Theory, Models, & Application*, Second Edition, San Francisco.
- Tomcikova, L (2016), 'The effective recruitment and selection practices of organizations in the financial sector operating in the Slovak republic', *exclusive e-Journal*, ISSN: 1339-4509, pp 1-7.
- Vedung, E (2013), 'Some comments on Four Waves of Evaluation', 2nd European Environmental Evaluators Network Forum.
- Zohrabi, M (2011), 'An Introduction to Course and/or Program Evaluation', *Pan-Pacific Association of Applied Linguistics*, 1345-8353, pp 59-70.