

Fostering the Shopping Malls Accessibility to Encourage the Sustainable Tourism

Nurul Sukma Lestari and Rachel Dyah Wiastuti

Hotel Management Department, Faculty of Economics & Communication, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia 11480

Keywords: Accessibility, Accessible, Accessible Tourism, Sustainable Tourism, Shopping Mall

Abstract: Shopping has emerged as one of the biggest expenditures in the tourism industry. Shopping malls represent the main shopping site for an urban destination such as Jakarta. Moreover, the destination should continuously provide not only a diverse place to shop, but also a convenience and accessible place for all to sustain the tourism value. The aim of this study is to determine the shopping malls accessibility based on UNWTO Accessible Tourism concept as a part of sustainable tourism. Data were gathered from direct field observation and interview from January to June 2018. Jakarta Tourism Board official website was employed as references to aside eight Jakarta shopping malls as research objects. The findings refine the shopping malls accessibility based on six categories; parking area, signage, elevators, public telephones, public toilets and pricing. The results reveal good compliance for pricing in term of no rising fee for the visitor with special requirements. However, the public telephone is hardly found and a limited number of public toilets for children and disabled are available. Therefore, this study contributes to providing added value information for tourism destination to advance the shopping experience for tourist and visitor by constructing the shopping malls for everyone.

1 INTRODUCTION

Tourism is comprised of a wide range of activity such as shopping (Choi, et al., 2016), that can be the main activity in Urban Tourism. Shopping is considered as one of the biggest tourism destination revenue (Albayrak, et al., 2016). Some tourist even points out shopping as their motivation to visit the destination (Murphy, et al., 2010). To cater to the shopping activity, shopping malls than comes as the priority venue (LeHew & Wesley, 2007). The shopping mall is public buildings that provide various goods and services for everyone (Bashiti & Rahim, 2015). Shopping malls and retailers have partnerships that are beneficial for all parties (UNWTO, 2018), where cities utilize shopping and retail experiences to increase regional income, while shopping malls and retailers also benefit from buying and selling transaction (UNWTO, 2014). All tourism product and facilities must fulfill the accessibility concept to be enjoyed by all travelers in terms of age, gender and the ability of each person (Wiastuti, et al., 2018), including a shopping mall. In this term, the shopping mall must comply with the concept of accessible tourism that allows people with disabilities or not to

do tourist activities independently and with equity and dignity (UNWTO, 2016).

People with special needs or people with disability are a huge potential to become travelers and will spend money on tourism (Souca, 2010). Data also shows the growth of people with special needs is higher than population growth worldwide (World Tourism Organization and Fundación ACS, 2015). Thus, able to cater to all people with special need with all possible resources are also considered to maintain tourism sustainability (D'Hond & Stevens, 2010). Sustainable tourism is a tourism that not only thinks about present value but also future value with less negative impact for surroundings (Stoneking, 2018). Meanwhile, though the shopping mall supports the tourism destination and able to enhance the city branding, shopping mall core aspect is a business purpose.

Thus, providing accessibility can be a challenge yet broaden more business opportunity in the future (Chikuta, et al., 2019). Shopping mall eventually should be able to be accessed by everyone despite any limitation. The purpose of this study is to determine the shopping malls accessibility based on UNWTO

Accessible Tourism concept as a part of sustainable tourism.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Tourism for All

Tourism for All means as a form of tourism that that enables people with access requirements, including mobility, vision, hearing and cognitive dimensions of access, to function independently and with equity and dignity through the delivery of universally designed tourism products, services and environments (UNWTO, 2016). Tourism plan designs and developed leisure that can be enjoyed by everyone no matter their physical, social or cultural conditions (Alles & Teresa, 2007). Tourism for all is including people with physical impairment including visual and hearing, elderly people, temporary impairment, travellers carrying luggage, pregnancy women, and traveller with children especially using stroller (ENAT, 2014). All people have the same right to be able to enjoy all the services available in the tourism business (Özogul & Baran, 2016)

2.2 Accessibility

The meaning of accessibility can be interpreted as providing flexibility so that it can accommodate all the needs and interests of each user (Valdes, 1998). Accessibility in the United Nations is to ensure that persons with disabilities can continue their activities freely with their basic rights and participate equally with others (UN, 2015).

2.3 Accessible Tourism

Accessible tourism means tourism can be accessed by all who are disabled, an old person or temporarily disabled or who value tourism facilities with easy road access, and clear instructions (Souca, 2010). Accessible tourism is a cooperation between all parties that involved, and make sure that all people with low mobility, visual impairments and hearing impairments can continue their activities on their own freely, equally and dignify through universal design for tourism (Michopoulou, et al., 2015).

In stating accessible tourism must be based on eight principles, namely (Michopoulou, et al., 2015): (a) Respect for inherent dignity, individual autonomy including the freedom to make one's own choices, and independence of persons; (b) Non-discrimination; (c) Full and effective

participation and inclusion in society; (d) Respect for difference and acceptance of persons with disabilities as part of human diversity and humanity; (e) Equality of opportunity; (f) accessibility; (g) Equality between men and women; and (h) Respect for the evolving capacities of children with disabilities and respect for the right of children with disabilities to preserve their identities.

Common requirements accessibility for tourism facilities and site are (World Tourism Organization and Fundación ACS, 2015) : (a) Parking area: special parking areas and specially designated set-down and pick-up points should be available for the vehicles of persons with reduced mobility bearing proper identification as near to the entrance/ exit of the building or sites as possible, and individual parking spaces should be sufficiently large to enable passengers with disabilities to move comfortably between cars and wheelchairs and be situated so that persons using wheelchairs, crutches or braces are not compelled to move behind cars; (b) Signing: all information should be clearly indicated and have an accessible customer-service area reserved for use by persons with reduced mobility and as near as possible to the entrance, Announcements should be both visual and acoustic, Accessible services and facilities should be clearly indicated easily understood symbols; (c) Elevator: In multi-storey structures an adequate number of elevators should be large enough for a person using a wheelchair to enter and turn easily, and accommodate people with vision impairment; (d) Public Telephones: Public telephones should be designed and laid out for public use in such a way that they can be used by everyone regardless of height, mobility problems, or sensory problems; (e) Public Toilets: Accessible toilet stalls and washbasins should be installed at the same location as the standard toilets; (f) Pricing: the price shall not give rise to an increase in rates for customers with disabilities.

2.4 Sustainable tourism

The definition of sustainable tourism by UNESCO is tourism that respects and maintain the authenticity of local culture, the environment of the local community and travellers (Fien, et al., 2010). Sustainable tourism participates in increasing regional income, create economic development for the local environment and open many job opportunities for the local community (Halter & Randle, 2012). UNWTO set 17 Sustainable Development Goals that linked to tourism (World Tourism Organization and United Nations

Development Programme, 2017). Sustainable tourism is about refocusing things to maintain a balance between boundaries and usages, so they can adapt if there is a continuous change and keep on planning and monitoring (Sustaining Tourism, 2014).

3 METHOD

This paper is categorized as descriptive research with a qualitative approach to gather actual information of the object (Soewadji, 2012). The object of this research is shopping malls in Jakarta, that were selected based on one measurement which is shopping malls that were referred in the official website of Jakarta Tourism and Cultural Board. As of January 10th, 2018, there are eight shopping malls in Jakarta. This data was slightly different from the data retrieved in January 2019 that referred 16 shopping malls, with additional new malls and previous malls remain the same. Table 1 refine the eight-shopping mall as this research objects, which are later abbreviated in the result and discussion section of this paper.

Table 1: Research objects.

No	Shopping Malls	Abb	Location
1	Pasaraya Blok M	PR	South Jakarta
2	Ciputra Mall	CM	West Jakarta
3	Central Park Mall	CP	West Jakarta
4	Pacific Place Mall	PP	South Jakarta
5	Plaza Senayan Mall	PS	South Jakarta
6	Senayan City Mall	SC	South Jakarta
7	Plaza Indonesia Mall	PI	Central Jakarta
8	Grand Indonesia Mall	GI	Central Jakarta

Data were accumulated from observation and interview within six months from January to June 2018. The observation was conducted as direct field observation for all shopping malls listed in Table 1. It required 18 to 25 hours or equivalent to two to three days to accomplish observe one shopping mall depends on the mall's scale and size. The bigger the malls the longer time required to be observed. Observation guide and check list were developed as an observation tool. The content of the guide and check list can be classified into six parts; parking area, signing, elevator, public telephones, public toilet, and pricing.

In addition, documentation was carried out in the same period with observations in the form of photographs of the actual implementation or situation and collected all related printed material from each

mall. Meanwhile, a structured interview was conducted with shopping malls employee. One shopping mall equal with minimum one employee in the customer service department. Interview results were recorded in the interview note. The result of the observation, documentation and interview were then collected and analyzed for further findings and discussion.

4 RESULT AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Result

The result is explained in six sections refer to common requirements accessibility; parking area, signing, elevator, public telephones, public toilet and pricing. Each shopping malls name will be abbreviated refer to Table 1.

4.1.1 Parking Area

PR, CM, CP, PP, PS, SC and GI provide integrated parking area for cars, motorcycle and bicycle under mall's management. In fact, disability and women park are available in all malls with its location near the entrance. In addition, all parking area is monitored and secured by the mall's employee to ensure the safety and any possible inquiry occurred. Car call service is also available in most of the information desk.

PR car parking area however divided into two areas refer to the building structure that divided into two building; Pasaraya Building A (West) and Pasaraya Building B (East). Bicycle park located in the East area. While East building complies the accessibility, West building more likely show many accessibility problems, especially in a vertical movement that required a ramp for different surface level.

CM parking area for motorcycle and bicycle are in the same location. Though bicycle park will be free of charge, the motorcycle still on an hourly basis. CM is adjacent with Hotel Ciputra, thus share the same parking area with no separation slot for the mall's visitor or for hotel guest. However, during the hotel event such as a wedding, there is a separation area specified for hotel guest coming for the wedding venue. In this case, the parking employee will secure the area.

Similar to CM, CP is also adjacent to Pullman Central Park Hotel. However, although both are

located next to another and have the same designated building for parking, the parking slot for hotel guest and the mall's visitor are different. This is applied the same to GI that adjacent to BCA Office Tower. Signage is available to locate which parking is for the mall's visitor and which one is not. Moreover, PP that adjacent with Ritz Carlton Pacific Palace Hotel and Residence also equipped with separated parking area.

CP is the only mall that provides bicycle park in the main entrance area in just a few steps away from main lobby Arjuna. CP also provide valet service that locates in three points at Lumina Lobby, Laguna Lobby and Lower Ground Mezzanine Floor and close by from disable parking space.

PP parking area for motorcycle is located outside the mall area and adjacent to other building within walking distance from the nearest mall entrance. PS provides only one point for valet service in Dining Alley entrance. SC parking area for motorcycle 500cc and above are located near the main entrance with designated parking area. Signage for the eligible motor category is written. Meanwhile, other motorcycle category should be a park in other areas.

GI parking area for a car considers as the one that pops up with the latest technology and service. Visitor can choose to park their vehicle in the traditional mode or in the new mode. Traditional mode means visitor come to GI, enter the parking area, search for the vacant park, and pay for the parking fee upon exit from the mall. New mode means an online parking reservation system called SMARK Parking. This way assures visitor to get park slot confirmation even before arriving without the need to go here and there finding the slot.

To be able to use the new mode, the visitor must download the SMARK Parking application in their mobile. It can be downloaded from Google Play and Apple Store. Afterword, the visitor must create an account, log in and top up the credit balance. The apps feature is friendly use. First is to check the parking availability. Apps will show how many vacant park slot availabilities in GI. Second is to do the reservation. The visitor will be shown the booking fee, the vehicle car number and input the promo code if any. Once the booking is complete, the QR code will be pop up. Upon arrival in the mall, a visitor needs to enter the parking area and find the designated SMARK Parking highlighted in blue color. Simply scan the QR code in the park portal and visitor free to park anywhere in the designated area. This new mode indeed beneficial for a visitor, it is less real-time update, time saving, cashless, and convenience

(Smakr Indo Maxima, 2019). Meanwhile, a bicycle park in GI locates in East Mall basement and West Mall basement. Motorcycle park is only available at West Mall basement.

Only PI that provided motorcycle park and bicycle park outside of the mall and managed by other parties apart from the mall's management. In other words, PI does not provide both motorcycle and bicycle park for the visitor. CM and PS are the only malls that have parking in both landscape and basement or building. Thus, bus parking area won't be a problem for both malls. Meanwhile, other malls such as PR, CP, PP, SC, PI, GI equipped with only basement or building parking space. This condition becomes a constraint for a group visitor coming with a big bus. Most of the time, all group visitor who came by bus will be dropped in the main entrance.

4.1.2 Signing

PR, CM, CP, PP, PS, SC, PI, and GI equipped with shopping mall brand name signage. The brand name signage can be read from a distance with proper identification. Information signage is written clearly, can be seen clearly, in pictogram and words, mostly in English. Information facilities can be classified into two modes; one is information point without the mall's employee or called as self-service information and the other one is information desk that secure by the employee or normally called as a customer service counter. All shopping malls provide customer information desk located near the entrance. The number of information desk may vary depends on each mall. CM for example, has four main entrance; South Lobby, West Lobby, East Lobby and North Lobby, but only two information desks provided at North Lobby and East Lobby. Thus, another entrance remains no information desk. CP has three main entrance; Lumina Lobby, Laguna Lobby and Sogo Lobby, with another entrance that links to other parts of Central Park Residence and Pullman Hotel. Though, CP provides several information desks located in Lower Ground Floor, Ground Floor, Mezzanine Floor and L2 Floor. PS and PI called the information desk as concierge desk. PS concierge is right in front of the entrance of Level 1 only. While, PI concierge locate in several points. Though the information desk can only be found in several main entrances at all shopping malls, other mall's employee such as security staff is available to assist visitor for any inquiry occurred. By then, direct and fast respond will be obtained as visitor problem solving.

Not only all shopping malls have an information desk, but also an information point. This information point is varied in its form and mode. PI, GI and PS for example, provide information point in the form of touch screen Internet Protocol Television (IPTV) without audio and illuminated board located on every floor near with escalator. SC has IPTV in front of every elevator and illuminated board at every floor near the escalator. CP, PR and PP have illuminated board for visual content scattered in every floor. CP has a phone booth information point located in every floor thus visitor should be able to communicate directly with the mall's employee. However, upon observation the phone booth on several floors is not working properly.

Signage to detect the toilet is available for all shopping malls. It comes in the form of the pictogram of male and female body shape. Only SC has the signage in the form of a male and female bag. Other than pictogram, toilet signage is equipped with the written word in English, either for male or female. Yet, PR has it in Bahasa Indonesia. Signage to detect the emergency is also available, such as exit signage, assembly point signage, emergency stairs signage, and entry signage. It is written in English, located in a visible place. Signage to detect the instruction such as push and pull for the door is available for all shopping malls.

Meanwhile, directory signage is scattered in several mall's areas, either indoor or outdoor. This directory mainly to locate the entrance, exit, toilet, praying room, parking, information desk, information point, ATM center, elevator, and escalator. Mostly are equipped with pictogram and written in English.

All shopping malls use an acoustic announcement in Bahasa Indonesia only. The announcement was given refer to several timings within mall operational hours. During the mall's opening hours, there is an announcement to welcome all the visitor. During the mall's operational hours, there is an announcement about the latest event, the new tenant, the promotion and sometime the missing child. During the mall's closing hours, there is an announcement about the remaining time left until the closing time. Thus, the visitor has adequate time to estimate their time in the mall.

4.1.3 Elevator

PR, CM, CP, PP, PS, SC, GI and PI provided elevator as a facility of the malls. PR has four elevators in two different locations. Two elevators located near the parking park and two elevators located in the middle of the mall with a big window design. Elevator

located near parking area with small size that can accommodate baby stroller but not a wheelchair. The position of the elevator is impossible for people with a wheel chair to reach the elevator from the parking area, because there is a horizontal movement obstacle from the parking area to elevator location.

CM has four elevators, two located in the back area of the mall and two elevators located in the middle of the mall. Two elevators in the back area started from lower ground level comply with steps to reach the location. While, two elevators in the middle started from the ground floor. The elevator is designed with big window glasses with braille button. CP has many elevators scattered in a different location; main mall area and Tribeca Park area, equip braille button with the large size for wheelchair and baby stroller to enter and move freely. PS, GI, SC and PI provide various elevator point equipped with a button in braille mode. The elevators are wide enough for a wheelchair and the stroller.

4.1.4 Public Telephone

There are no public telephones provided in all shopping mall. A public telephone is only available in CP in the form of an internal phone booth on each floor. It called as internal due to its network that can only be used to communicate to the customer service. In another word, it cannot be used to make a phone call to a mobile phone number or landline number. The position of the phone booth is visible and easy to locate, but unfortunately the mode is unadjustable that might not suitable for all height of visitor, such as children and person with a wheelchair.

4.1.5 Public Toilet

PR, CM, CP, PP, PS, SC, PI and GI equipped with a public toilet. The eight-shopping mall's public toilets are equipped with wash-basin, soap dispenser and hand-dryer machine or a paper napkin.

PR has a public toilet in every floor located in the back area of the mall. There is no disabled toilet. The toilet has a narrow room consisting of a toilet, a trash can and a tissue holder which is more often empty. The room does not allow for wheelchairs to go inside. For nursery room there is one located on the fifth floor near the playground with the inadequate condition. The floor is dirty, no tissue is available, the base for the baby cot is dirty, the baby's room in general can be said to be neglected. There are no children toilet also.

CM public toilets are located on all floors, but not all toilets are available for disability. The female and male toilet is separated. CM has one nursery room on

the first floor sponsored by Pigeon Company. The room condition is well maintained, clean and neat. The nursery room is furnished with a wash basin, soap, hand dryer, baby box, water dispenser with cold- hot water, sofa, chair, baby diapers table. Various baby product is provided by Pigeon. In case of emergency, telephone console is available, connected to the information desk. Not only the facilities, but also information related to the baby such as breastfeeding and how to bathe a new-born are accommodated. However, CM does not provide children toilets.

CP public toilets are available only one on each floor with only three cubicles in each toilet. The female and male toilet is separated. Inside the toilet is equipped with trash bins, tissue box that is fully loaded, toilets, and a trash bin for sanitary disposal. There is no children toilet. Disabled toilets are available adjacent to public toilets. But the toilet for a disability which is on the ground floor is located at the narrow alley, making it difficult for wheelchairs. CP have one nursery room on every floor, sponsored also by Pigeon Company. The nursery room is furnished with a wash basin, trash bin for diapers, a table with mattresses for changing baby diapers, and a breast milk campaign on the wall.

PP public toilets are available two to three on each floor. Each toilet has a different theme, equipped with an automatic deodorizer, a wash basin that uses automatic taps, foamy soap, and the latest hand dryer. Inside the cubicle is an available toilet with flusher, trash can and tissue box. As for male toilets, the urinal has a sensor so that it can flush directly. PP provide special design for children toilet; equipped with lower height toilet and additional toilet seat portable for a toddler. Toilets for disabled people are located adjacent to public toilets. The room is wide enough, to allow the wheelchair to move freely; equip with wash basin and toilet bowl. Near the toilet bowl, a hand rail made of iron is installed that can be used to as a holding rail for any disable persons who come without accompany. Nursery Room is located on Level 3, available for public from and sponsored also by Pigeon Company.

PS has four public toilets, three disabled toilets, and two nursery rooms, on the first floor. On the second floor there are two public toilets and two nursery rooms. While on the third floor there is one public toilet and one nursery room. P4 and P5 floors have only one public toilet each. The dining alley area has two public toilets. Specifically, the nursery room on the third floor equips with a toilet bowl.

PI public toilets are available on each floor. However, disable toilet can only be found on several

floors such as LB floor, second floor, and third floor. Meanwhile, children toilet is provided on the first floor and second floor. The last is nursery room; available only on the first floor and second floor, sponsored by Pigeon and equipped with some baby amenities. In addition, GI provides not only public toilet, children toilet, disabled toilet and nursery room, but also drivers' room along with above public hygiene mentioned. This is surprisingly different as most shopping malls provide only simple drivers' waiting area instead of comfortable and adequate drivers' room. Pigeon collaborate with GI in providing and setting up the nursery room.

4.1.6 Pricing

There is no additional charge for people with special requirements to enter the shopping mall and to use all the facilities. To cater to the family visitor with children and people with walking difficulty, shopping malls provide rental service for baby stroller and wheelchair. It can be on a rental fee basis or complimentary basis depends on the mall's regulation. Though the amount of the baby stroller and wheelchair is limited, the mall's management requires no advanced reservation for this service.

PR does not provide wheelchairs or baby strollers rental service. CM charge nothing for a visitor who wants to rent wheelchairs or baby strollers. However, the rental deposit is a must and cost approximately IDR 150.000 to IDR 300.000 for one-time use, that will be returned afterwards. CP charge nothing as well for both rental service without the need for a deposit. Visitor requires only to hand the valid ID card upon rental that will be returned afterwards. PP, PS, SC, PI and GI provides complimentary use for baby strollers and wheelchair rental located in a Concierge desk. Most of the baby stroller and wheelchair can be obtained at one information desk in each mall. Only GI that provides the service at two information desk point since the mall's structure is divided into two building; east and west, thus each building equipped with one rental service.

The price for baby room, nursery room, disable toilet for all shopping malls is on a complimentary basis. Though visitor may find some baby product inside the baby room such as diapers, baby shop, cotton bud, it is all provided for free with no additional cost. No reservation required, simply go show and use the facilities. It was unlocked, thus any visitor able to enter freely.

The price for parking is varied depends on the vehicle types and the service types. Car parking fee is ranging from IDR 4.000 to 5.000 on an hourly basis.

Motorcycle parking fee is ranging from IDR 1.000 to 2.000 on an hourly basis. Bus parking fee is ranging from IDR 6.000 to 7.000 on an hourly basis. This price is valid for whatever the car types, the motorcycle types of the bus types. Although visitor uses priority parking space such as female parking area or disables parking area, the fee remains the same. There is no additional fee adheres by the mall's regulation to be able to use the female park and disable park. The only difference if the only visitor wants to use valet service or an online parking reservation. Then additional fee will occur, ranging from IDR 20.000 to 40.000 exclude the parking cost.

4.2 Discussion

Due to common requirements accessibility for parking area, shopping malls indeed meet the accessibility requirement in term of providing designated drop off and pick up point and providing a designated area for people with reduced mobility. This is shown by the existence of a disable parking slot and ladies parking slot; both are located near the entrance. Not only providing with the facilities, but most shopping mall suit the facilities with the employee particularly responsible for it. The employee secures the slot to ensure the right person on the right slot. The parking space is wide enough for people with a wheelchair to move around and move forward.

Findings show that shopping malls provide a parking area for various type of vehicles. Unfortunately, not all vehicles park is integrated and managed by the mall's management. For example, PI does not provide motorcycle park, while PP and SC do provide but locate outside the mall and join as a parking space with other office building nearby. This finding also related to market that diverse for every mall. PI and PP are classified as high-end mall compare to other six malls, thus visitor comes with motorcycle does not become as the main consideration. Motorcycle park is only crucial to cater to the mall's employee or tenant's employee. On the contrary, PR, CM and CP provide adequate motorcycle park integrated with another parking and managed by the mall's management. This show that the mall's segmentation is not high- end market, thus motorcycle park is provided either for a visitor or for mall's or tenant's employee. The other concern is the bicycle park available only in several malls. Another facility related to parking space is the parking slot information. SC and CP for example, provide a real-time number of vacant parking slot before entering the parking area, thus visitor can know the availability

in various space. While PR and CM do not have this kind of technology so that visitor should self-estimated the vacant slot.

Due to common requirements accessibility for signing, shopping malls indeed meet the accessibility requirement in term of providing clearly indicated information and customer service area near the entrance. This is shown by the existence of signage for directory, emergency and precaution, and the existence of customer service desk or information desk or concierge desk. All information desk is located a step away from the main entrance. Moreover, the announcement is also presented in two modes; visual and acoustic. The only downside is the language barrier and the repetition for the announcement, some are delivered in English, some in Bahasa Indonesia, and some only be repeated once or twice. Apart from the language barrier, most signage equips with a symbol. However, some non-universal symbol still can be found and minimum braille symbol all around the places.

Due to common requirements accessibility for elevator it does meet the accessibility requirement in term of providing an elevator in multi-story structures where an adequate number of elevators should be large enough for a person using a wheelchair to enter and turn easily and accommodate people with vision impairment. This is shown by the existence of an elevator in every mall. Before entering the elevator there is a warning sign that mentions the elevator is a priority for disable, older customer and person with a baby stroller.

Findings show that shopping malls provide an elevator with a different type of size, model and accessibility appliance. Unfortunately, only a few elevators have large compartment area so that wheelchair can enter and turn easily in and out, as well as braille that can be found only either outside or inside the elevator area. However, CP, PP, PS, SC, and PI are a good example in providing an elevator that can cover the wheelchair and equip with braille inside and outside the elevator area. Meanwhile, PR and CM have narrow elevator area with no braille at all. In addition, there is a barrier in term of horizontal movement to reach the elevator from the waiting area in front of the elevator.

Due to common requirements accessibility for public telephones it does not meet the accessibility requirement in term of providing a public phone designed and laid out for public use in such a way that can be used by everyone regardless of height, mobility problems, or sensory problems. Finding shows all shopping malls do not have a public phone. Only CP has a phone booth for the visitor, located on

each floor with un-adjustable height. A public phone is important for the visitor who any inquiry, emergency or even mobile phone obstacle, thus visitor can get fast respond in any possible circumstances without the need to go to the nearest information desk.

Due to common requirements accessibility for public toilets it does meet the accessibility requirement in term of providing accessible toilet stalls and washbasins at the same location as the standard toilet. This is shown by the existence of disable toilet located on the same floor with a standard toilet, nursery room and children toilet. Findings show that shopping malls provide public toilet facilities vary in its number, size and design. Some shopping mall provides disable toilet on each floor, but some do not comply with the same. This is similar to the nursery room and children toilet. Most shopping malls collaborate with other company such as Pigeon company in providing baby amenities inside the nursery room. This collaboration brings benefit for both Pigeon and shopping mall that eventually lead to visitor satisfaction and promotion. However, the toilet for standard male and female are provided in all shopping malls on each floor. CP, PP, PS, SC, GI and PI reveal good compliance in cater to the disabled toilet in the same location with a standard toilet. On the contrary, CM provides only one floor for disabling toilet.

Due to common requirements accessibility for pricing, no rising fees for using the special requirement. Everyone is welcome to enter and to visit the shopping malls despite their disability. In addition, priority parking space for disable and female are also free of charge. The only additional fee if the only visitor decides to use valet service and online parking reservation system, which are on an optional basis. All public hygiene facilities are given for free, either for male, female, children, disable and nursery room.

5 CONCLUSIONS

Eight shopping malls in Jakarta as this research object found to be good compliance of common requirements accessibility refer to UNWTO accessible tourism standards. There are rooms to be improved and rooms that are well implemented according to six accessible tourism categories; parking area, signage, elevators, public telephones, public toilets and pricing. Rooms to be improved are public telephone and public hygiene facilities. While parking area, signage, elevators, and pricing are

considered as implemented. However, there are some accessible standards shopping malls must adhere such as the existence of braille, obstacle in horizontal movement with compliance in the visual announcement. In conclusion, to encourage shopping tourism sustainability, shopping venue such as shopping mall are required to foster its accessibility standards by providing the mall that can be accessed by everyone. The more shopping mall is accessible for all, the more visitor is willing to come and do revisit intention. Shopping mall must not only provide complete and adequate accessible facilities, but most importantly to keep in continuously improvement to meet the visitor demand, followed by well trained staff to cater all the visitor inquiry. Moreover, the destination should continuously provide not only a diverse place to shop, but also a convenience and accessible place for all to sustain the tourism value.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was supported by BINUS Research Grant 2018. Furthermore, authors would like to send the appreciation for everyone we have met and interviewed along the way.

REFERENCES

- D'Hond, E. & Stevens, M., 2010. *Community Memories for Sustainable Urban Living*. s.l., SciTePress, pp. 77-80.
- Darcy, S., Cameron, B. & Pegg, . S., 2010. Accessible tourism and sustainability: a discussion and case study. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 18(4), pp. 515 - 537.
- Albayrak, T., Caber, M. & Çömen, N., 2016. Tourist shopping: The relationships among shopping attributes, shopping value, and behavioral intention. *Tourism Management Persepectives*, Volume 18, pp. 98-106.
- Alles, F. & Teresa, M., 2007. *Accessible tourism: analysis of hotel accessibility in the province of Cádiz*, Cádiz: University of Cádiz.
- Anon., 2016. *Interaction Design Foundation*. [Online] Available at: <https://www.interaction-design.org/literature/topics/accessibility> [Accessed 06 February 2019].
- Bashiti, A. & Rahim, A. A., 2015. A Study on The Accessibility in Shopping Malls for People with Disabilities (PWDS) in Malaysia. *International Journal of Natural Sciences Research*, 3(1), pp. 9-20.
- Chikuta, O., Plessis, E. d. & Saayman, M., 2019. Accessibility Expectations of Tourists with Disabilities in National Parks. *Tourism Planning & Development*, 16(1), pp. 1-18.

- Choi, M. J., Heo, C. . Y. & Law, R., 2016. Progress in Shopping Tourism. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 33(sup 1), pp. 1-24.
- ENAT, 2014. *Tourism for All*. [Online] Available at: <http://www.tourismforall.eu/index.html> [Accessed 4 February 2019].
- Fien, J., Calder, M. & White, C., 2010. *Teaching and Learning for a Sustainable Future*. [Online] Available at: http://www.unesco.org/education/tlsf/mods/theme_c/mod16.html [Accessed 13 February 2019].
- Halter, R. & Randle, D., 2012. *Sustainable Tourism: A Key to Global Solutions*. [Online] Available at: https://www.huffingtonpost.com/dreese-halter/sustainable-tourism-a-key_b_1301966.html [Accessed 13 February 2019].
- LeHew, M. L. & Wesley, S. C., 2007. Tourist shoppers' satisfaction with regional shopping mall experiences. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 1(1), pp. 82-96.
- Michopoulou, E., Darcy, . S., Ambrose, . I. & Buhalis, . D., 2015. Accessible tourism futures: the world we dream to live in and the opportunities we hope to have. *Journal of Tourism Futures*, 1(3), pp. 179-188.
- Murphy, L., Benckendorff, P., Moscardo, G. & Pearce, P. L., 2010. *Tourist Shopping Villages; Forms and Functions*. 1st ed. New York: Routledge.
- Özogul, G. & Baran, G. G., 2016. Accessible Tourism: The Golden Key in The Future for The Specialized Travel Agencies. *Journal of Tourism Futures*, 2(1), pp. 79-87.
- Smark Indo Maxima, 2019. s.l.:s.n.
- Soendari, T., n.d. *Metode Penelitian Deskriptif*. s.l.: UPI.
- Soewadji, J., 2012. *Pengantar Metodologi Penelitian*. Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Media.
- Souca, L. M., 2010. Accessible Tourism - The Ignored Opportunity. *Annals of Faculty of Economics*, 2(1), pp. 1154-1157.
- Stoneking Sr , R., 2018. *Sustainable Tourism Means Accessibility For Everyone*, Tampa/St.Petersburg: s.n.
- Sustaining Tourism, 2014. *Sustaining Tourism*. [Online] Available at: <https://sustainabletourism.net/> [Accessed 14 February 2019].
- UN, 2015. *Accessibility and Development; Mainstreaming disability in the post-2015 development agenda*, New York: United Nation.
- UNWTO & UNDP, 2017. *Tourism and the Sustainable Development Goals – Journey to 2030*, Madrid: UNWTO.
- UNWTO, 2014. *Global Report on Shopping Tourism*, Madrid: UNWTO.
- UNWTO, 2016. *Manual on Accessible Tourism for All: Principles, Tools and Best Practices – Module I: Accessible Tourism – Definition and Context*, Madrid: UNWTO.
- UNWTO, 2016. *World Tourism Day 2016 “Tourism for All - promoting universal accessibility” Good Practices in the Accessible Tourism Supply Chain*, Madrid: UNWTO.
- UNWTO, 2018. *UNWTO Tourism Highlights: 2018 Edition*, Madrid: UNWTO.
- Valdes, L., 1998. *Accessibility on the Internet*. [Online] Available at: <https://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/disacc00.htm> [Accessed 06 February 2019].
- Wiastruti, R. D., Adiati, M. P. & Lestari, N. S., 2018. *Implementation of accessible tourism concept at museums in Jakarta*. Medan, IOP Publishing Ltd, pp. 1-9.
- World Tourism Organization and Fundación ACS, 2015. *Manual on Accessible Tourism for All – Public-Private Partnerships and Good Practices*, Madrid: UNWTO.
- World Tourism Organization and United Nations Development Programme, 2017. *Tourism and the Sustainable Development Goals – Journey to 2030*, Madrid: UNWTO.